

2nd Administrative Reforms Commission’s 10th Report titled “Refurbishing of Personnel Administration – Scaling New Heights”

Details of Government’s decisions on recommendations of 2nd Administrative Reforms Commission

Sl. No.	Recommendations made by Administrative Reforms Commission	Government’s decision
1.	<p>1. (Para 5.3.6) Stage of Entry into the Civil Services</p> <p>a. Government of India should establish National Institutes of Public Administration to run Bachelor’s Degree courses in public administration/ governance/ management. In the long run it is expected that these specialized centres of excellence (National Institutes of Public Administration) would evolve as major sources of civil services aspirants.(1)</p> <p>2. b. Selected Central and other Universities should also be assisted to offer such graduate level programmes in public administration/ governance/public management which will produce graduates to further expand the pool of eligible applicants to the civil services.(2)</p> <p>3. c. The courses offered in these universities should include core subjects such as the Constitution of India, Indian legal system, administrative law, Indian economy, Indian polity, Indian history and culture apart from optional subjects.(3)</p> <p>4. d. Graduates of the above mentioned special courses from the National Institutes of Public Administration and selected universities would be eligible for appearing in the Civil Services Examinations. Further, graduates in other disciplines would also be eligible to appear in the Civil Services Examination provided they complete a ‘Bridge Course’</p>	<p>(a) to (i) The setting up of specialized institutions may deny equal opportunities to all candidates. It was decided to request all Central Universities in the country to have “Public Administration” as a subject at under graduate level. It was also decided that all candidates coming to government service through the Civil Services Examination must go through a compact paper in Public Administration prescribed by the Expert Committee of the Ministry of Human Resource Development, during the induction training programme.</p>

Sl. No.	Recommendations made by Administrative Reforms Commission	Government's decision
5.	<p>in the core subjects mentioned above. The Bridge course should be run by the same selected national institutes/ universities, which conduct the graduate level courses stated in (c) above.(4)</p> <p>e. Liberal need-based scholarships should be provided to students admitted to the Institutes/Universities.(5)</p>	
6.	<p>f. An 'Expert Committee' should be appointed immediately by the Government in consultation with UPSC to develop the curricula and determine the admission policy to these selected institutes/universities. This Committee should inter alia have the following terms of reference:</p> <p>i. Lay down norms for identification universities and institutes where the said courses would be conducted. ii. Design the content of the curricula for the said courses in public administration. iii. Prescribe the modalities for admission to these courses. iv. Prescribe the modalities and design of the bridge courses. The Commission strongly recommends that the Expert Committee be appointed straightway so that the new courses could be started in some of these institutions/universities from the coming academic year. The Commission also feels that the bridge courses and their effectiveness should be reviewed based on the experience of five years.(6)</p>	
7.	<p>g. Since this is a major reform relating to an important area of governance and will need coordinated guidance, especially in the initial years, a high-level oversight/coordination committee with the Prime Minister as Chairman may be constituted to meet once in three months and give guidance to the implementing agencies and concerned institutions.(7)</p>	

Sl. No.	Recommendations made by Administrative Reforms Commission	Government's decision
8.	h. The reforms to the scheme of the examination system as recommended in paragraph 5.5 may be taken up immediately. Examination and Recruitment reforms following the introduction of public administration /governance management as a full-fledged degree course in National Institutes of Public Administration and selected universities would take some time to be operationalised. Till then, the existing system, where students from all disciplines can appear for the competitive examinations, may continue (8) .	
9.	i. Students who have acquired a graduation degree in the above-mentioned course would have option to join any other career of their choice either in the public or private sector. (9)	
10.	<p>2. (Para 5.4.17) Age of Entry and Number of Attempts</p> <p>a. The permissible age for appearing in the Civil Services Examination should be 21 to 25 years for general candidates, 21 to 28 years for candidates from OBC and 21 to 29 years for candidates from SC/ST as also for those who are physically challenged.(10)</p>	<p>(a): It was decided that the upper age limit should be 26 years for Unreserved Candidates, 28 for OBC, 29 for SC/ST Candidates with additional 2 years for Physically Challenged in each category.</p>
11.	b. The number of permissible attempts in the Civil Services Examination should be 3, 5, 6 and 6 respectively for general candidates, candidates from OBC, candidates from SC/ST and physically challenged candidates respectively. (11)	<p>(b) It was decided that 3 for Unreserved Candidates, 5 for OBC, 6 for SC/ST Candidates with additional 2 attempts for Physically Challenged candidates in each category.</p> <p>The above provision regarding reduction of upper age limit and number of attempts will be implemented from Civil Service Exam, 2015.</p>

Sl. No.	Recommendations made by Administrative Reforms Commission	Government's decision
12.	c. The present cut-off date for determining the eligibility in terms of age (i.e. 1st of August in the year of the examination) may continue.(12)	(c) It was decided to retain 1 st August in the year of examination as the cut-off date for the eligibility as recommended by 2 nd ARC.
13.	<p>3. (Para 5.5.5.3) Structure of the Civil Services Examination</p> <p>a. <i>Structure of Examination:</i> Either of the following two models may be adopted for compressing the examination cycle.</p> <p>i. The Preliminary and Main Examinations for the Civil Services Examination would be conducted together on two to three consecutive days. Evaluation of papers for the Main Examination should be done in case of only those candidates who have secured a threshold level of marks in the Preliminary Examination. The personality test would follow thereafter. OR</p> <p>ii. Based on the results of the Preliminary Examination, candidates eligible for taking the main examination and the personality test would be short listed in accordance with their rankings. Only these short-listed candidates would be eligible for appearing in the Main Examination, which would be conducted within two months of the Preliminary Examination. The short list would be limited to about two to three times of the number of vacancies available. Thus it would be possible to start the Personality Test and the Main Examination almost simultaneously.(13)</p>	(a) to (c): It decided that the structure of Civil Services Examination both for the preliminary and the main examination may not be reviewed further for now since changes have been implemented very recently.
14.	<p>b. Content:</p> <p>i. The Preliminary Examination should consist of an objective type test having one or two papers on general studies including the Constitution of India, the Indian legal system, Indian economy, polity, history and culture. There should</p>	

Sl. No.	Recommendations made by Administrative Reforms Commission	Government's decision
15.	<p>be no optional subjects.(14)</p> <p>ii. The Main Examination should consist of two papers only in the compulsory subjects. These compulsory subjects may include Constitution of India, Indian legal system, Indian economy, polity, history and culture etc. The question papers should be of the conventional descriptive type. Besides, there should be a separate essay paper as a part of the Main Examination.</p> <p>c. Steps may be taken by DOPT in consultation with the UPSC to finalise the syllabi of compulsory subjects for the both the preliminary and main examination, for the recruitment cycle 2010. This could later on be dovetailed with the recommendation of the "Expert Committee" suggested in Paragraph 5.3.6.(15)</p>	
16. 17.	<p>4. (Para 5.7.5) Other Modes of Induction into the Civil Services</p> <p>a. The induction of officers of the State Civil Services into the IAS should be done by the UPSC on the basis of a common examination.(16)</p> <p>b. UPSC should conduct such an examination annually for officers from the State Civil Services who have completed 8 to 10 years of service in Grade 'A' posts. The eligibility criteria should also include norms such as an upper age limit of 40 years etc. On the basis of this examination, the UPSC should provide the State Governments with an eligibility list. The State Governments should fill up their quota for promotion to the IAS on the basis of this eligibility list. A maximum of two attempts should be allowed to an eligible candidate for taking this examination. To ensure that the existing officers in the</p>	<p>(a) to (d):The new scheme involving competitive common examination for induction of officers of State Civil Services into IAS has been modified with the approval of Prime Minister (PM) and is to be placed on the DoPT's website for a month. Thereafter the scheme is to be re-submitted to PM. These developments were noted.</p> <p>Since, UPSC had conveyed its consent for conducting the examination for allied services also, the Central Government also directed that Cadre Controlling Authorities may be formally consulted on this subject.</p>

Sl. No.	Recommendations made by Administrative Reforms Commission	Government's decision
18.	<p>State Civil Services are not denied adequate opportunities, the examination in the next two years may be conducted for all such eligible officers and the upper age limit of 40 years may be introduced, thereafter.(17)</p> <p>c. The mechanism mentioned above should also be applied in case of induction into other All India Services at the State level.(18)</p> <p>d. Induction by way of promotion into Group 'A' Central Services should, in addition to consideration of ACRs, also be done through conduct of examination on the basis of the criteria as mentioned above. The nature of the examination, ratio of posts to be filled by promotion etc. should be decided by the concerned departments in consultation with the UPSC.(19)</p>	
20.	<p>5. (Para 5.8.6) Allotment of Cadres to the All India Services</p> <p>a. The following amendments should be made in the new Cadre Allocation Policy (2008) for allocation of Cadre to candidates selected for the IAS:</p> <p>i. At least one vacancy each year in each of the cadres of AGMUT (only for the State of Arunachal Pradesh) Manipur, Meghalaya, Mizoram, Nagaland, Sikkim and Tripura may be allotted to a successful candidate domiciled therein provided he/she has opted for his/her home State. This may be done even if there is no 'insider' vacancy in these cadres.</p> <p>ii. In case there is more than one eligible candidate, then the allotment may be done in the order – ST, SC, OBC and General candidates, as applicable to each state.</p> <p>iii. Once the home State quota of the above-mentioned North Eastern States is</p>	<p>(a) The insider AIS officers belonging to NE Cadres should be given priority for home cadre in Cadre Allocation Policy (CAP). The CAP, 2008 addresses the concerns of NE Cadres to a large extent. For Jammu & Kashmir too, without disturbing the CAP, 2008, DoPT would accommodate cadre transfer requests in a similar manner.</p>

Sl. No.	Recommendations made by Administrative Reforms Commission	Government's decision
	filled up, further allocation may be done as per the Cadre Allocation Policy (2008), after making adjustments necessitated by the changes recommended above.(20)	
21.	<p>6. (Para 5.9.6) The Union Public Service Commission.</p> <p>a. Promotion of officers through Departmental Promotion Committees (DPC), upto the level of Selection Grade may be delegated to the concerned Departments. The UPSC should supervise the functioning of these DPCs through periodic reviews, audit etc.(21)</p>	<p>(a): Central Government accepted the recommendation of the ARC that the UPSC should supervise the functioning of DPC through periodic review etc. for promotion of officers upto the level of selection grade which should be delegated to the concerned departments.</p>
22.	<p>b. In the case of disciplinary proceedings, consultation with the UPSC should be mandatory only in cases involving likely dismissal or removal of a government servant.(22)</p>	<p>(b): It was noted that another GoM on “measures that can be taken by the Government to tackle corruption” has considered the issue and recommended that consultation with UPSC should continue. However, second stage consultation with Central Vigilance Commission (CVC) may be dispensed with. Necessary orders to do away with second stage advice of CVC in cases where UPSC’s consultation is mandatory have been issued on 26th Sept. 2011.</p>
23.	<p>(Para 6.8) Capacity Building</p> <p>a. Every government servant should undergo a mandatory training at the induction stage and also periodically during his/her career. Successful completion of these trainings should be a minimum necessary condition for confirmation in service and subsequent promotions. Mandatory induction trainings should be prescribed for Group D staff also before they are assigned postings.(23)</p>	<p>(a) & (b) Recommendations accepted. Mandatory training for all government servants at induction stage as well as at mid-career should be prescribed. The National Training Policy should be made comprehensive by including training plans for officers in other Central Govt. Ministries/ Departments.</p>
24.	<p>b. A monitoring mechanism should be set up for overseeing the implementation of the National Training Policy (1996).(24)</p>	

Sl. No.	Recommendations made by Administrative Reforms Commission	Government's decision
25.	c. The practice of having a 'Common Foundation Course' for all Group 'A' Services – generalist, specialized and technical, should continue. For Group 'B' and 'C' Services, the Institute of Secretarial Training and Management (ISTM) may be developed as the nodal agency for design and delivery of common Foundation Courses.(25)	(c) Recommendation accepted. Examination for common foundation course and of the phase trainings during the probation should be made qualifying for clearing the probation in the services where marks of these exams are not counted for determining inter-se seniority.
26.	d. All civil servants should undergo mandatory training before each promotion and each officer/official should be evaluated after each training programme. Successful completion of the training programmes should be made mandatory for promotions.(26)	(d) to (f) Recommendation accepted. Mid-Career Training should be made mandatory for all Group A & B services for promotions.
27.	e. The objective of mid-career training should be to develop domain knowledge and competence required for the changing job profile of the officer. To this end, mid career learning opportunities relevant to specific domains or specializations should be made available for officers.(27)	
28.	f. Public servants should be encouraged to obtain higher academic qualifications and to write papers for reputed and authoritative journals.(28)	
29.	g. A strong network of training institutions at the Union and State levels needs to be built up to cater to the training requirements of civil servants. However, instead of spreading resources over a large number of institutions, a few institutions should be identified for capacity building and upgradation.(29)	g) To strengthen training institutions, a Plan Scheme should be designed to support training organizations of Central Civil Services and State ATIs.
30.	h. The composition of governing bodies of the national training institutions such as the LBSNAA, SVPNPA, IGNTA and also the State Administrative Training Institutes should be broadened by	(h) Recommendation accepted. National Training Institutes should be provided with greater autonomy and operational flexibility for which DOPT may take appropriate action.

Sl. No.	Recommendations made by Administrative Reforms Commission	Government's decision
31	<p>inducting eminent experts. The governing bodies should be adequately empowered to enable them to discharge their functions efficiently.(30)</p> <p>i. A national institute of good governance may be set up by upgrading one of the existing national/state institutes. This institute would identify, document, and disseminate best practices and also conduct training programmes.(31)</p>	<p>(i) National Institute of Good Governance may be set up on a public-private partnerships model. It should function as a think tank and provide policy advice to Governments.</p> <p>Further, a Plan Scheme should be designed to support training organizations of Central Civil Services and State ATIs. The different services/ Cadre Controlling Authorities should not only open their institutes but also strengthen it.</p>
32.	<p>8. (Para 7.3.3) Recruitment at Group 'B' Level</p> <p>a. Each Department, dealing with both the general as well as specialized Services (Group B), may set up committees to examine what changes are required in the system of recruitment and promotions to these posts. Prima-facie the Commission is of the view that in order to infuse fresh thinking, a certain percentage of vacancies (say 25% every year) at the level of Section Officer as well as for other specialized Group 'B' posts, should be filled through 'Direct Recruitment'.(32)</p>	<p>(a):All services should set up Committees to examine changes required in the system of recruitments and promotions to Group B posts. It is felt that induction of Section Officers should be encouraged through direct recruitment in Government departments including Central Secretariat. Recommendations made by the 6th Central Pay commission to infuse new blood would also be taken in consideration while preparing the proposal in this regard and 25% of recruitment at the level of Section Officer.</p>
33.	<p>9. (Para 7.5.7) Recruitment at Graduate Level (Group 'B' non-gazetted and Group 'C')</p> <p>a. The age limit for all positions (Group 'B' non-gazetted and Group 'C') – requiring a graduate degree - should be 20-25 years for general candidates with a relaxation of three years for OBC and five years for SC/ST and physically challenged candidates.(33)</p>	<p>(a) to (c) The DoPT will take up the matter on file in accordance with the decision taken in respect of Para -5.4.17(a).</p>
34.	<p>b. The examination system should be based on a well designed objective type question paper.(34)</p>	

Sl. No.	Recommendations made by Administrative Reforms Commission	Government's decision
35	c. There is no need to conduct separate examinations for posts (Group 'B' non-gazetted and Group 'C') which require a graduate degree. There should be a common examination and thereafter, the candidates should be allowed to apply for various posts with this examination score.(35)	
36.	10. (Para 7.6.6) Recruitment for LDCs a. The Commission endorses the stand taken by the Government that recruitment of LDCs should be phased out.(36)	(a) to (b): Agreed with the part (b) of the recommendation which prescribes modification in the existing recruitment process.
37.	b. In case it is felt necessary to recruit LDCs in certain organizations/ departments, especially in field offices, their recruitment should be done through the Staff Selection Commission. The existing recruitment process needs to be modified on the following lines: i. The minimum qualification should be class 12th pass or equivalent. ii. The test should comprise of objective type questions. iii. Short listed candidates should be administered a skills test. This should be conducted on computers so that the capability of the candidates to use word processing softwares is also assessed.(37)	Not agreed with part (a) of the recommendation which related to LDCs and directed DoPT to refer the matter to the Cabinet for reconsideration of the its decision taken in the year 2003.
38.	11. (Para 7.7.10) Training for Group 'B' and 'C' Employees a. Unless a government employee undergoes mandatory induction training he/she should not be assigned any regular post.(38)	(a) to (c): Induction training should be made mandatory for all group B&C employees.
39.	b. Successful completion of prescribed training courses should be a pre-condition for all promotions.(39)	
40	c. All training programmes should be concluded with an evaluation of the	

Sl. No.	Recommendations made by Administrative Reforms Commission	Government's decision
	trainees' performance, and this should be an input while assessing their annual performance.(40)	
41.	<p>12. (Para 7.8.6) Group 'B' and 'C' Employees: Promotions</p> <p>a. The posts of Assistants under the Central Secretariat Service should be filled in the ratio of 40 per cent by promotion from UDCs of Central Secretariat Clerical Service Cadre, 40 per cent by Direct Recruitment and 20 per cent through Limited Departmental Competitive Examination.(41)</p>	The recommendation not accepted. As per CCS Rules, 2009, 75% of vacancies at Asst. Level are being filled by direct recruitment. This is also in conformity with the recommendations made by 6 th Pay Commission. As of now, this policy may continue.
42.	<p>13. (Para 7.9.6) Group 'B' and 'C' Employees: Performance Appraisal</p> <p>a. The Appraisal Form should provide the Reporting Officer with multiple options on the level of performance against which he/she would indicate numerically the level at which the officer reported upon has performed.(42)</p>	(a) to (c):Recommendations accepted. The new Appraisal Form already indicates numerical grading.
43.	<p>b. The proforma of the Confidential Reports of Group B and C posts may include a column wherein the area/field of interest of the official reported upon (i.e. Health, Information Technology, Finance, Transport, Defence etc) is indicated, which may be considered for future postings.(43)</p>	
44.	<p>c. A mechanism of acknowledging the receipt of the ACR proforma at various stages may be adopted so that delays are avoided and an element of accountability is introduced.(44)</p>	
45.	<p>13. (Para 8.7) Placement at Middle Management Level</p> <p>a. In posting officers in Government of India, the primary consideration should be to select the most suitable person for the post that is on offer.(45)</p>	(a) to (g): Assigning of domains to the officers of All India Services and Central Civil Services will help in encouraging development of specialization. However, domain assignment should be done at completion of 18 years of service as it may not be possible to identify domains during the first 13 years of service as most of the officers are on the
46.	<p>b. Domains should be assigned by the Central Civil Services Authority (the</p>	

Sl. No.	Recommendations made by Administrative Reforms Commission	Government's decision
47.	<p>Commission has recommended the constitution of this Authority in paragraph No 9.8 of this Report) to all officers of the All India Services and the Central Civil Services on completion of 13 years of service.(46)</p> <p>c. The Central Civil Services Authority should invite applications from all officers who have completed the minimum qualifying years of service, for assignment of domains. The applications should specify the academic background of officers, their research accomplishments (if any) and significant achievements during their career, relevant to the domain applied for. A consultative process should be put in place where the officers should be interviewed and their claims to specific domains evaluated. The Authority should thereafter assign domains to the officers on the basis of this exercise. In case some domains do not attract applicants, the Authority should assign these domains to officers with the relevant knowledge and experience.(47)</p>	<p>field assignments in the first 10 years of career. All services should be identifying the domains where specialization is needed and domain assignment should be done in consultation with the officers. While placing officers in Government of India, efforts should be to match experience and specialization with job requirements.</p>
48.	<p>d. All vacancies arising at the level of Deputy Secretary/Director during a financial year should be identified well before the beginning of that financial year, by the Department of Personnel and Training (DOPT). The Ministries concerned should also give a brief job description for these positions. All these posts and their job description should be notified to the cadre controlling authorities of the concerned All India Services and Central Services. On receipt of nominations from the cadre controlling authorities, the DOPT should try to match the requirements of various positions with the competencies of the officers in the 'offer list'. The DOPT should then seek approval for the entire list from the Competent Authority.(48)</p>	

Sl. No.	Recommendations made by Administrative Reforms Commission	Government's decision
49.	e. The Central Civil Services Authority should be charged with the responsibility to fixing tenure for all civil service positions and this decision of the Authority should be binding on Government.(49)	
50.	f. Officers from the organized services should not be given 'non-field' assignments in the first 8-10 years of their career.(50)	
51	g. State Governments should take steps to constitute State Civil Services Authorities on the lines of the Central Civil Services Authority.(51)	
52.	<p>14. (Para 9.8) Placement at Top Management Level</p> <p>a. The present empanelment system for short listing officers for posting at officers for posting at the SAG level and above should be replaced by a more transparent and objective placement procedure.(52)</p>	(a)to(g): The decision deferred on the recommendation for the time being.
53.	b. At higher levels in government, it is necessary to ensure that the tasks assigned to a public servant match his/her domain competence as well as aptitude and potential.(53)	
54.	c. Ministries should classify all of their SAG level posts according to their relevant functional domains.(54)	
	d. There is need to introduce competition for senior positions in government (SAG and above) by opening these positions in Government (including attached and subordinate offices) to all Services. This principle would apply to all posts including those that are presently	

Sl. No.	Recommendations made by Administrative Reforms Commission	Government's decision
	<p>encadred with the organised Group 'A' Services. In order to operationalise this, government should make the continued participation of any of the organised civil services in the Central Staffing Scheme, contingent upon the implementation of this principle in those Departments/Cadres.</p>	
55.	<p>i. For the positions at the Joint Secretary/SAG level and above, the Central Civil Services Authority would invite applications from amongst all the eligible officers from the All India Services and Group 'A' Central Services which are participating in the scheme.(55)</p>	
56.	<p>ii. For positions at the HAG level and above, the Central Public Service Authority would, in consultation with Government, earmark positions for which outside talent would be desirable. Applications to fill up these posts would be invited from interested and eligible persons from the open market and also, from serving eligible officers.(56)</p>	
57.	<p>iii. While carrying out this exercise, the Central Civil Services Authority would stipulate the eligibility criteria, the required domain expertise as well as the requirements of qualifications, seniority and work experience. The Authority would conduct interviews to short-list suitable officers for these posts. Government would make the final selection on the basis of this shortlist.(57)</p>	
58.	<p>e. A Central Civil Services Authority should be constituted under the proposed Civil Services Bill. The Central Civil Services Authority shall be a five-member body consisting of the Chairperson and four members (including the member-secretary). The Authority should have a full time Member-Secretary of the rank of Secretary to Government of India. The Chairperson and members of</p>	

Sl. No.	Recommendations made by Administrative Reforms Commission	Government's decision
59.	<p>the Authority should be persons of eminence in public life and professionals with acknowledged contributions to society. The Chairperson and members of the Authority shall be appointed by the President on the recommendations of a Committee consisting of the Prime Minister and the Leader of the Opposition in the Lok Sabha. (Explanation:- Where the Leader of the Opposition in the Lok Sabha has not been recognized as such, the Leader of the single largest group in the Opposition in the Lok Sabha shall be deemed to be the Leader of the Opposition).(58)</p> <p>f. The Central Civil Services Authority should deal with matters of assignment of domains to officers, preparing panels for posting of officers at the level of Joint Secretary and above, fixing tenures for senior posts, deciding on posts which could be advertised for lateral entry and such other matters that may be referred to it by the Government. (59)</p>	
60.	<p>g. A similar procedure should be adopted for filling up vacancies at SAG level and higher in the central police agencies. For example, in the Central Para-Military Forces the senior positions should be opened to competition from officers of the CPMFs, IPS and the Armed Forces (including those completing their Short Service Commissions). Similarly for the intelligence agencies officers from the armed forces as well as the CPOs with experience in the field of intelligence should be considered for postings at higher levels in the intelligence agencies.(60)</p>	
61.	<p>15. (Para 10.12) Deputation of Civil Servants to Organizations Outside Government</p> <p>a. In drawing up the list of external organizations to which government servants can be permitted to go on</p>	<p>(a) to (b): Accepted in principle. DOPT has recently issued consolidated guidelines in this regard on 11.01.2012.</p>

Sl. No.	Recommendations made by Administrative Reforms Commission	Government's decision
62.	<p>deputation, the primary consideration should be the objectives and activities of such organizations and not merely its organizational structure. For the present Government should permit deputation of civil servants only to such organizations that are engaged in non-profit making activities.(61)</p> <p>b. This policy may be reviewed after three years.(62)</p>	
63.	<p>16. (Para 11.15) Performance Management System</p> <p>a. A good employee performance appraisal system is a pre-requisite for an effective performance management system. The existing performance appraisal system should be strengthened on the following lines:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> □ Making appraisal more consultative and transparent – performance appraisal systems for all Services should be modified on the lines of the recently introduced PAR for the All India Services. □ Performance appraisal formats to be made job specific - the appraisal format prescribed for civil servants should have three sections i.e. (i) a generic section that meets the requirements of a particular service to which the officer belongs, (ii) another section based on the goals and requirements of the department in which he/she is working, and (iii) a final section which captures the specific requirements and targets relating to the post that the officer is holding. □ <i>Performance appraisal should be year round:</i> provisions for detailed work-plan and a mid-year review should be introduced for all Services. □ <i>Guidelines need to be formulated for assigning numerical rating:</i> DOPT should formulate detailed guidelines to guide the reporting and reviewing officers for assigning 	<p>(a): Accepted the recommendation in principle. New PAR system is being reviewed and DOPT would work out a modified version which may be adopted by all Services. This model could be a comprehensive one with scope for variations for different work requirements. GoM directed that a comprehensive model be designed with scope for variations for different services.</p>

Sl. No.	Recommendations made by Administrative Reforms Commission	Government's decision
64.	<p>numerical ratings for their subordinates. Training modules for implementing performance management systems should be designed and introduced for training programmes for civil servants.(63)</p> <p>b. Government should expand the scope of the present performance appraisal system of its employees to a comprehensive performance management system (PMS).(64)</p>	(b) to (c) Accepted the recommendations.
65.	<p>c. In implementing PMS in government, it must be emphasized that the PMS should be designed within the overall strategic framework appropriate to the particular ministry/department/organization. It is also necessary to link individual contributions to strategic objectives of the organization. It will therefore be necessary for each ministry /department/organization to customize its PMS relevant to them, while incorporating the general features described in Chapter 11.(65)</p>	
66.	<p>d. Annual performance agreements should be signed between the departmental minister and the Secretary of the ministry/heads of departments, providing physical and verifiable details of the work to be done during a financial year. The actual performance should be assessed by a third party – say, the Central Public Services Authority – with reference to the annual performance agreement. The details of the annual performance agreements and the result of the assessment by the third party should be provided to the legislature as a part of the Performance Budget/Outcome Budget.(66)</p>	d): It might not be feasible to have annual performance agreements.
	17. (Para 12.5) Motivating Civil	

Sl. No.	Recommendations made by Administrative Reforms Commission	Government's decision
	<p>Servants</p>	
67	<p>a. There is need to recognise the outstanding work of serving civil servants including through National awards. Awards for recognizing good performance should also be instituted at the State and district levels. It must be ensured that selection for such awards is made through a prompt, objective and transparent mechanism because the value of such awards should not get compromised by either subjectivity or lack of transparency. Further, all organizations should evolve their own in-house mechanism for rewarding good performance from simple, verbal and written appreciation to more tangible rewards.(67)</p>	<p>a) Agreed with the recommendation of the ARC.</p>
68.	<p>b. Selections for foreign assignments referred to in Paragraph 12.4.3.2 should be made, based on the recommendations of the Central Civil Services Authority. The Authority should follow the due process of inviting applications from eligible candidates and preparing a panel of officers who are most suitable for such assignments.(68)</p>	<p>(b) The recommendation may not be accepted.</p>
69.	<p>c. It should be the responsibility of the head of the office to examine the job content of each person working in the organization to ensure that the job content is meaningful and challenging so that the employee derives a sense of satisfaction in performing the tasks assigned to him/her. The head of the office could seek the assistance of a professional agency for this purpose.(69)</p>	<p>(c) & (d). Agreed with the recommendation of the ARC.</p>
70.	<p>d. Each head of office should ensure that a congenial work environment is created in the office. His/her success in this should be an element in evaluating his/her performance.(70)</p>	

Sl. No.	Recommendations made by Administrative Reforms Commission	Government's decision
71.	<p>18. (Para 13.4) Accountability</p> <p>a. A system of two intensive reviews – one on completion of 14 years of service, and another on completion of 20 years of service - should be established for all government servants.(71)</p>	<p>(a) & (b): Accepted the recommendations and recommended that a complete review of the performance appraisal form be done.</p> <p>(c) Did not agree with the recommendation of ARC.</p>
72.	<p>b. The first review at 14 years would primarily serve the purpose of intimating to the public servant about his/her strengths and shortcomings for his/her future advancement. The second review at 20 years would mainly serve to assess the fitness of the officer for his/her further continuation in government service. The detailed modalities of this assessment system would need to be worked out by government.(72)</p>	
73.	<p>c. The services of public servants, who are found to be unfit after the second review at 20 years, should be discontinued. A provision regarding this should be made in the proposed Civil Services Law. Besides, for new appointments it should be expressly provided that the period of employment shall be for 20 years. Further continuance in government service would depend upon the outcome of the intensive performance reviews.(73)</p>	
74.	<p>19. (Para 14.6) Disciplinary Proceedings</p> <p>a. In the proposed Civil Services law, the minimum statutory disciplinary and dismissal procedures required to satisfy the criteria of natural justice should be spelt out leaving the details of the procedure to be followed to the respective government departments. The present oral inquiry process should be converted into a disciplinary meeting or interview to be conducted by a superior officer in a summary manner without the trappings and procedures borrowed from court trials. This would require that the CCS (CCA) Rules, 1965 be repealed and</p>	<p>(a) to (d): DoPT issued orders on 26.09.2011. In cases involving vigilance issues, the consultation with UPSC will continue while second stage consultation with CVC has been dispensed with. However, in those cases where consultation with UPSC is not required, the second stage consultation with CVC will continue.</p>

Sl. No.	Recommendations made by Administrative Reforms Commission	Government's decision
75.	<p>substituted by appropriate regulations.(74)</p> <p>b. No penalty of removal and dismissal should be imposed, except by an Authority, which is at least three levels above the post which the government servant is holding. Other penalties – apart from dismissal and removal – may be imposed by an Authority which is at least two levels above the current post of the government servant. No penalty may be imposed, unless an inquiry is conducted and the accused government servant has been given an opportunity of being heard.(75)</p>	
76.	<p>c. The two-stage consultation with the CVC in cases involving a vigilance angle should be done away with and only the second stage advice after completion of the disciplinary process, should be obtained. In addition, for cases involving a vigilance angle, no consultation with the UPSC should be required.(76)</p>	
77.	<p>d. Consultation with the UPSC should be mandatory only in cases leading to the proposed dismissal of government servants and all other types of disciplinary cases should be exempted from the UPSC's purview.(77)</p>	
78.	<p>20. (Para 15.6) Relations between the Political Executive and Civil Servants</p> <p>a. There is a need to safeguard the political neutrality and impartiality of the civil services. The onus for this lies equally on the political executive and the civil services. This aspect should be included in the Code of Ethics for Ministers as well as the Code of Conduct for Public Servants.(78)</p>	<p>(a) and (b): A a detailed paper on the matter of Code of Ethics for Ministers may be prepared first. The matter will be considered later.</p>
79	<p>b. The Commission would like to reiterate its recommendation made in its Report on "Ethics in Governance" while examining</p>	

Sl. No.	Recommendations made by Administrative Reforms Commission	Government's decision
80.	<p>the definition of corruption under the Prevention of Corruption Act, 1988, wherein it has been recommended that “abuse of authority unduly favouring or harming someone” and “obstruction of justice” should be classified as an offence under the Act.(79)</p> <p>c. It is essential to lay down certain norms for recruitment in government to avoid complaints of favouritism, nepotism, corruption and abuse of power. These norms are:</p> <p>i. Well-defined procedure for recruitment to all government jobs. (80)</p> <p>81. ii. Wide publicity and open competition for recruitment to all posts.(81)</p> <p>82. iii. Minimisation, if not elimination, of discretion in the recruitment process.(82)</p> <p>83. iv. Selection primarily on the basis of written examination or on the basis of performance in existing public/ board/ university examination with minimum weight to interview.</p> <p>These principles could be included in the ‘Civil Services Bill’ as recommended by the Commission in Chapter 17.(83)</p>	
84.	<p>21. (Para 16.17) Civil Services Code</p> <p>a. ‘Civil Services Values’ and the ‘Code of Ethics’ should be incorporated in the proposed Civil Services Bill.(84)</p>	(a) & (b): Decision deferred.
85.	<p>b. Conduct Rules for civil servants need to be redrawn based on the values and code of ethics as outlined in this Chapter (Chapter 16).(85)</p>	

Sl. No.	Recommendations made by Administrative Reforms Commission	Government's decision
86.	<p>22. (Para 17.5) The Civil Services Law A new Civil Services Bill may be drafted. The following salient features may be included in the proposed Bill:</p> <p>I. <i>Title of the Bill</i>: The Bill may be called 'The Civil Services Bill'.</p> <p>II. <i>Definitions</i>: "Civil Services" shall comprise of all personnel holding civil posts under the Union.</p> <p>III. <i>Civil Service Values</i>: The Civil Services and the Civil Servants shall be guided by the following values in addition to a commitment to uphold the Constitution, the discharge of their functions:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Absolute integrity at all times ii. Impartiality and non-partisanship iii. Objectivity iv. Dedication to public service v. Empathy towards weaker sections <p>The Heads of Departments shall be responsible for promoting these values in their organizations. The Central Civil Services Authority may from time to time review the adoption, adherence to and implementation of the Civil Service Values in the departments or organizations under the Union.(86)</p>	Decision deferred.
87.	<p>IV. Code of Ethics: The following should be included in the Code of Ethics for civil servants:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Integrity: Civil servants should be guided solely by public interest in their official decision making and not by any financial or other consideration either in respect of themselves, their families or their friends. ii. Impartiality: Civil servants in carrying out their official work, including functions like procurement, recruitment, delivery of services etc, should take decisions based on merit and free from any partisan consideration. iii. <i>Commitment to public service</i>: civil servants should deliver services in a fair, effective, impartial and courteous manner. iv. <i>Open accountability</i>: civil servants are 	

Sl. No.	Recommendations made by Administrative Reforms Commission	Government's decision
88.	<p>accountable for their decisions and actions and should be willing to subject themselves to appropriate scrutiny for this purpose.</p> <p>v. <i>Devotion to duty</i>: civil servants should maintain absolute and unstinting devotion towards their duties and responsibilities at all times.</p> <p>vi. <i>Exemplary behaviour</i>: civil servants should treat all members of the public with respect and courtesy and at all times should behave in a manner that upholds the rich traditions of the civil services.(87)</p> <p>V. Recruitment and Conditions of Service: Recruitment and conditions of service of persons appointed to the 'Public Services' shall be governed by Rules made under this Act. The following principles of recruitment should be included for all appointments not routed through the UPSC or SSC:</p> <p>i. Well-defined merit based procedure for recruitment.</p> <p>ii. Wide publicity and open competition for recruitment to all posts.</p> <p>iii. Minimisation, if not elimination, of discretion in the recruitment process.</p> <p>iv. Selection primarily on the basis of written examination or on the basis of performance in existing public/board/university examination with minimum weight-age to interview.</p> <p>An independent agency should audit the recruitments made outside the UPSC and SSC systems and advise the government suitably. This audit should be conducted under the supervision of the UPSC.(88)</p>	
89.	<p>VI. New Conditions of Appointment: (1) A civil servant, not being a civil servant recruited or inducted for a short-term appointment, shall hold office for twenty years from the date of initial appointment.</p> <p>(2) The relationship between the Civil Servant and the Government of India</p>	

Sl. No.	Recommendations made by Administrative Reforms Commission	Government's decision
	<p>during the time he/she holds office shall also be governed by the rules made in this regard. All public servants shall be subjected to two intensive reviews on completion of 14 years and 20 years of service respectively. Their further continuance beyond 20 years will depend on the outcome of these reviews. It should be expressly provided that all new recruitments shall be for a period of 20 years and their continuance beyond 20 years would depend on the outcome of the intensive reviews.(89)</p>	
90.	<p>VII. Appointment to Senior Positions in Government: All positions in Government (including in the attached and subordinate offices) at the level of Joint Secretary and above would constitute the 'Senior Management Pool'. This would apply to all posts including those that are presently encadred with the organised Group A Services. All appointments to positions in this pool shall be made on the recommendations of the Central Civil Services Authority, which would go into the past performance and also evaluate the future potential of an officer. The Central Civil Services Authority should recommend a panel of officers suitable for a position in the Government and Government should choose an officer/person from this panel.(90)</p>	
91.	<p>VIII. Fixation of Tenures: All senior posts should have a specified tenure. The task of fixing tenures for various posts may also be assigned to this independent agency - Central Civil Services Authority.(91)</p>	
92.	<p>IX. Widening the Pool of Candidates for Selection to Senior Positions: Candidates outside the government system should be allowed to compete for</p>	

Sl. No.	Recommendations made by Administrative Reforms Commission	Government's decision
93.	<p>certain posts at senior levels (Additional Secretary and above). The task of identifying these posts should be entrusted to the Central Civil Services Authority.(92)</p> <p><i>Dismissal, Removal etc. of Civil Servants:</i> After the repeal of Articles 310 and 311 (as recommended in the Report on 'Ethics in Governance'), safeguards against arbitrary action against government servants should be provided in the new law. These safeguards should include:</p> <p>i. No penalty of removal and dismissal should be imposed, except by an authority, which is at least three levels above the post which the government servant is holding.</p> <p>ii. Other penalties – apart from dismissal and removal - may be imposed by an authority which is at least two levels above the current post of the government servant.</p> <p>iii. No penalty may be imposed, unless an enquiry is conducted and the accused government servant has been given an opportunity of being heard.</p> <p>iv. The Head of an organization should have powers to lay down the details of the enquiry procedure, subject to the general guidelines which may be issued by the Government from time to time.(93)</p>	
94.	<p>XI. A performance management system should be mandatory for every organization in the government.(94)</p>	
95.	<p>XII. Constitution of the Central Civil Services Authority:</p> <p>i. The Central Government shall, by notification in the Official Gazette, constitute a body to be known as the Central Civil Services Authority to exercise the powers conferred on, and to perform the functions</p>	

Sl. No.	Recommendations made by Administrative Reforms Commission	Government's decision
96.	<p>assigned to it, under this Act.(95)</p> <p>ii. The Central Civil Services Authority shall be a five-member body consisting of the Chairperson and four members (including the member-secretary). The Authority should have a full time Member-Secretary of the rank of Secretary to Government of India. The Chairperson and members of the Authority should be persons of eminence in public life and professionals with acknowledged contributions to society. The Chairperson and members of the Authority shall be appointed by the President on the recommendations of a Committee consisting of the Prime Minister and the Leader of the Opposition in the Lok Sabha. (Explanation:- Where the Leader of the Opposition in the Lok Sabha has not been recognized as such, the Leader of the single largest group in the opposition in the Lok Sabha shall be deemed to be the Leader of the Opposition).(96)</p>	
97.	<p>XIII. Functions of the Central Civil Services Authority: The Central Authority shall discharge the following functions:</p> <p>i. Review the adoption, adherence to and implementation of the Civil Service Values in the departments or organizations under the Central Government and send reports to the Central Government.</p> <p>ii. Assign domains to all officers of the All India Services and the Central Civil Services on completion of 13 years of service.</p> <p>iii. Formulate norms and guidelines for appointments at 'Senior Management Level' in Government of India.</p> <p>iv. Evaluate and recommend names of</p>	

Sl. No.	Recommendations made by Administrative Reforms Commission	Government's decision
98.	<p>officers for posting at the 'Senior Management Level' in Government of India.</p> <p>v. Identify the posts at 'Senior Management Level' in Government of India which could be thrown open for recruitment from all sources.</p> <p>vi. Fix the tenure for posts at the 'Senior Management Level' in Government of India.</p> <p>vii. Submit an annual report to Parliament.(97)</p> <p>XIV. Creation of Executive Agencies in Government: Government should be authorized to create or reorganize some or all of existing Departments into 'Executive Agencies'. The role of the Ministries should primarily be on policy formulation while implementation should be left to the Executive Agencies.(98)</p>	